RLP English 12A — Rhetoric and Argument: The Public Conversation

STUDENT WORKBOOK · UNIT 4 · WEEKS 14-18

What Is Education For? — The Researched Argument

Anchor text: John Henry Newman, The Idea of a University, Discourse VII (1852); Thomas Henry Huxley, A Liberal Education; and Where to Find It (1868); Anna Julia Cooper, The Higher Education of Women, from A Voice from the South (1892); John Dewey, My Pedagogic Creed (1897); National Center for Education Statistics, The Condition of Education and Digest of Education Statistics (current editions, public domain)

NAME	PERIOD	TEACHER

What you will hand in

1. **Lesson 4.1** — Synthesis grid of four authors plus two data observations (workbook p. 7)
2. **Lesson 4.2** — Extended definition of a key term plus a vocabulary and spelling set (workbook p. 8)
3. **Lesson 4.3** — Research-circle preparation sheet, recorded contributions and a revised question (workbook p. 9)
4. **Lesson 4.4** — Research proposal and an annotated bibliography of at least eight sources (workbook p. 10)
5. **Lesson 4.5** — Researched argument, annotated bibliography and a five-minute research defense (workbook pp. 11–13)

How to use this workbook

1. Every page here matches a lesson in the online course. Bring the page to the lesson; do not fill it in afterwards from memory.
2. The organizer pages are your **drafting space**. Anything scored is submitted online, in the lesson's own submit box: type or paste your answer from the page, and keep the paper page as your working copy. Page 10 is the Stage 1 organizer. Page 12 is the peer review sheet for Stage 2 — copy it once for each classmate you review (two are required). The course will not open the final draft until Stages 1 and 2 are submitted.
3. Write in it. Cross things out. A clean workbook at the end of a unit usually means the thinking happened somewhere else, or not at all.

John Henry Newman, *The Idea of a University*, Discourse VII (Dublin, 1852), Project Gutenberg #24526; Thomas Henry Huxley, "A Liberal Education; and Where to Find It" (1868), in *Lay Sermons, Addresses, and Reviews* (London, 1870), #16729; Anna Julia Cooper, "The Higher Education of Women," *A Voice from the South* (Xenia, Ohio, 1892), #61741; John Dewey, "My Pedagogic Creed" (1897), Wikisource; National Center for Education Statistics, *The Condition of Education* and *Digest of Education Statistics* (current editions), U.S. government works. Public domain. Composition instruction adapted from *Writing for Success* (BCcampus OpenEd, CC BY 4.0). Adapted and structured for classroom delivery by Sejal Learning Systems.

Unit 4 at a glance

#	Lesson	You produce	Workbook page	Standards
4.1	**Four Answers and the Data — Newman, Huxley, Cooper and Dewey** Anchor Text & Close Reading	Synthesis grid of four authors plus two data observations	p. 7	11-12.RI.3.A, 11-12.RI.1.C, 11-12.RI.1.D, 11-12.RI.3.B, 11-12.RI.3.C, 11-12.RI.3.D
4.2	**Language Lab — Defining Contested Terms and Using Academic Vocabulary** Rhetoric & Language Lab	Extended definition of a key term plus a vocabulary and spelling set	p. 8	11-12.RI.1.B, 11-12.RL.1.B, 11-12.W.3.A.c, 11-12.W.2.A
4.3	**Research Circle — Testing Questions and Sources Together** Socratic Dialogue & Listening Lab	Research-circle preparation sheet, recorded contributions and a revised question	p. 9	11-12.SL.1.A, 11-12.SL.1.C, 11-12.W.1.A.b
4.4	**Writing Workshop — From Question to Annotated Bibliography** Recursive Writing Workshop	Research proposal and an annotated bibliography of at least eight sources	p. 10	11-12.W.1.A, 11-12.W.1.A.b, 11-12.W.3.A.e, 11-12.W.3.A
4.5	**Key Assignment — Researched Argument: What Is Education For?** Culminating Unit Assessment	Researched argument, annotated bibliography and a five-minute research defense	pp. 11–13	11-12.W.2.A, 11-12.W.1.A, 11-12.W.1.A.b, 11-12.RL.1.A, 11-12.RI.1.A, 11-12.SL.2.A, 11-12.SL.2.B, 11-12.SL.2.C

The key assignment

Researched Argument, 1,800-2,500 words, with an annotated bibliography.

Unit 4 reading schedule

> One row per lesson. Tick each row when you have finished the reading, not when you have started it.

Lesson	Read	Bring to the lesson	Done
13	Newman, Discourse VII; Huxley, "A Liberal Education"; Cooper, "The Higher Education of Women"; Dewey, "My Pedagogic Creed" (passages in the lesson); one current NCES table (Lesson 4.1)	Your synthesis grid and two data observations	
14	The six mentor sentences and model definition in the lesson; the anchor passage closest to your key term (Lesson 4.2)	Your extended definition, stipulation and vocabulary set	
15	The five research-circle passages; your own two sources; then sources for your bibliography (Lessons 4.3-4.4)	Your preparation sheet and revised question; your Stage 1 proposal and annotated bibliography	
16	The key assignment packet; your annotated sources and the two anchor authors you will engage (Lesson 4.5)	Your argument and defense planner	

Vocabulary in context

Fill the right-hand column *before* you read the definitions on page 6. A definition you wrote from the way a word was used is one you will still have in June; a definition you copied is not.

Term	Lesson	In my own words
liberal education	4.1	
synthesis	4.1	
correlation	4.1	
conversation (in research)	4.1	
extended definition	4.2	
stipulate	4.2	
domain-specific vocabulary	4.2	
median	4.2	
word family	4.2	
research question	4.3	
credibility	4.3	
advocacy source	4.3	
lead	4.3	
annotated bibliography	4.4	
research log	4.4	

Vocabulary in context (continued)

Term	Lesson	In my own words
paraphrase	4.4	
overreliance	4.4	

The definitions, for checking afterwards

> Check these only after your own column is full. Where you disagree with the definition, work out which of you the text supports — that disagreement is worth more than the definition.

liberal education 4.1 — Education aimed at developing the whole mind and judgment, not training for a single occupation.

synthesis 4.1 — Combining ideas from several sources to form a new understanding.

correlation 4.1 — A relationship between two measures that does not by itself show that one causes the other.

conversation (in research) 4.1 — The ongoing exchange of published arguments a writer enters and responds to.

extended definition 4.2 — A definition developed through class, distinguishing features, examples, non-examples and rival meanings.

stipulate 4.2 — To state explicitly how a term will be used in a particular argument.

domain-specific vocabulary 4.2 — Terms with precise meanings in a particular field.

median 4.2 — The middle value in an ordered set of data; not the same as the mean.

word family 4.2 — A group of words sharing a root, changed by affixes to indicate meaning or part of speech.

research question 4.3 — An arguable, researchable, focused and significant question that a researched argument answers.

credibility 4.3 — The degree to which a source can be trusted, based on its author, evidence, currency and purpose.

advocacy source 4.3 — A source produced to promote a position; it may be useful but must be read with its purpose in mind.

lead 4.3 — A promising direction or source for further research.

annotated bibliography 4.4 — A list of sources in citation format, each followed by a summary, evaluation and note on use.

research log 4.4 — A dated record of searches, sources found and changes to the question.

paraphrase 4.4 — Restating a source's idea in your own words and sentence structure, with citation.

overreliance 4.4 — Depending so heavily on one source that the argument becomes a report on it.

Synthesis grid — four answers and the data

Lesson 4.1 — Four Answers and the Data — Newman, Huxley, Cooper and Dewey · `11-12.RI.3.A, 11-12.RI.1.C, 11-12.RI.1.D, 11-12.RI.3.B, 11-12.RI.3.C, 11-12.RI.3.D`

Newman, Huxley, Cooper and Dewey answer one question: what is education for? Summarize each answer without judging it, then open one current federal table and record what it can and cannot show.

Author	Purpose of education	Who it is for	What it teaches	How to test the claim today

Table title	Source and date	Units

ONE THING THE TABLE SHOWS

ONE THING IT CANNOT SHOW (FOR EXAMPLE, CAUSE RATHER THAN CORRELATION)

THE AUTHOR WHOSE ANSWER THE DATA MOST COMPLICATES, AND HOW

Extended definition — the key term in my question

Lesson 4.2 — Language Lab — Defining Contested Terms and Using Academic Vocabulary · `11-12.RI.1.B, 11-12.RL.1.B, 11-12.W.3.A.c, 11-12.W.2.A`

An argument about a contested term is often an argument about its definition. Define yours precisely, then stipulate the meaning your essay will hold to.

MY KEY TERM, AND THE CLASS IT BELONGS TO

DISTINGUISHING FEATURES

Example	Non-example

A RIVAL DEFINITION FROM AN ANCHOR AUTHOR OR A SOURCE (QUOTED)

MY STIPULATION: IN THIS ESSAY, THE TERM MEANS…

Word or pair	Correct use in a sentence of my own

> Use principal / principle, criterion / criteria, average / median, and one domain-specific term from my sources.

Research-circle sheet — question and sources tested

Lesson 4.3 — Research Circle — Testing Questions and Sources Together · `11-12.SL.1.A, 11-12.SL.1.C, 11-12.W.1.A.b`

Come prepared, and test each source with the four questions: who produced it and what they gain if you believe it; when; what evidence; what limits. A good question is arguable, researchable, focused and significant.

MY QUESTION

WHY IT MATTERS, AND TO WHOM

CLOSEST ANCHOR AUTHOR, AND FURTHEST

Source	What it claims	Who / when / evidence / limits

ONE THING I DO NOT YET KNOW

SYNTHESIS: WHERE THE GROUP'S EVIDENCE AGREED, WHERE IT CONFLICTED, AND WHAT WOULD RESOLVE IT

MY REVISED QUESTION, AND ONE SENTENCE ON WHY IT CHANGED

Stage 1 — proposal and bibliography tracker

Lesson 4.4 — Writing Workshop — From Question to Annotated Bibliography · `11-12.W.1.A, 11-12.W.1.A.b, 11-12.W.3.A.e, 11-12.W.3.A`

This page is **submitted and scored** as your proposal plan. A proposal is a commitment you can change, but you must say when and why. Each annotation runs 100-150 words: summary, evaluation, use.

MY QUESTION

WHY IT MATTERS, AND TO WHOM

MY WORKING ANSWER (A HYPOTHESIS I EXPECT TO REVISE)

THE ANCHOR AUTHORS I WILL ENGAGE, AND THE EVIDENCE I NEED

#	Source (author, title, date)	Current?	Data?	Use: support, counter, background

SEARCH TERMS AND SYNONYMS THAT WORKED, AND ONE NARROWING OR BROADENING, WITH THE REASON

☐ At least eight sources; two current; one federal or state data source; two anchor authors

Argument and defense planner — what is education for?

Lesson 4.5 — Key Assignment — Researched Argument: What Is Education For? · `11-12.W.2.A, 11-12.W.1.A, 11-12.W.1.A.b, 11-12.RL.1.A, 11-12.RI.1.A, 11-12.SL.2.A, 11-12.SL.2.B, 11-12.SL.2.C`

Organize by reason, not by source: a paragraph that walks through one source at a time has handed its organization to the bibliography. Check every quotation and every number against the source itself.

MY QUESTION AND MY CLAIM

Section	Reason it advances	Sources (two or more)	Done

THE STRONGEST COUNTERCLAIM, ITS OWN EVIDENCE, AND MY ANSWER

BEFORE I SUBMIT

- [ ] Two anchor authors entered into the conversation
- [ ] Six or more credible sources, two current, one federal or state data
- [ ] Every quotation and number checked against its source
- [ ] 1,800-2,500 words; MLA Works Cited and research log

FIVE-MINUTE DEFENSE: THE QUESTION, THE ANSWER, THE STRONGEST OBJECTION — AND THE QUESTION I EXPECT TO BE ASKED

Peer review sheet

Lesson 4.5 · Stage 2 of the key assignment

Use one copy of this sheet for each of the two classmates you review. Use it on a classmate's rough draft. You are reviewing against the criteria the final essay is scored on — not against your own taste. Every comment must point at a sentence.

DRAFT WRITER / REVIEWER

Criterion	Where I see it working (quote the sentence)	One specific change that would improve it
Question and claim (11-12.W.2.A)		
Research (11-12.W.1.A, 11-12.W.1.A.b)		
Use of evidence (11-12.RL.1.A / 11-12.RI.1.A)		
Counterclaim		
Annotated bibliography and integrity		
Defense (11-12.SL.2.A, 11-12.SL.2.B, 11-12.SL.2.C)		

THE SINGLE MOST USEFUL CHANGE THIS WRITER COULD MAKE

One. Not five — a reviewer who names five names none.

> **Draft writer:** you will submit a revision note naming one specific change you made and the comment that caused it. Disagreeing with your reviewer is allowed; ignoring them without a reason is not.

MY REVISION NOTE

How this unit's essay is scored

Lesson 4.5

> These are the criteria your work is scored on, at the **proficient** level (the lesson holds the full four-level rubric). Score yourself in the middle column before you submit; the gap between your column and theirs is the most useful feedback in the unit.

Criterion	What proficient looks like	Me	Teacher
Question and claim (11-12.W.2.A)	Arguable, significant question; precise claim situated in the conversation of two anchor authors.		
Research (11-12.W.1.A, 11-12.W.1.A.b)	Six or more credible sources including current data; strengths and limits acknowledged; no overreliance.		
Use of evidence (11-12.RL.1.A / 11-12.RI.1.A)	Evidence organized by reason; every quotation and number exact and attributed; limits of data stated.		
Counterclaim	Strongest objection developed with its own evidence and answered.		
Annotated bibliography and integrity	At least eight entries with summary, evaluation and use; MLA; research log submitted.		
Defense (11-12.SL.2.A, 11-12.SL.2.B, 11-12.SL.2.C)	Clear line of reasoning; any visual labeled and sourced; questions answered with evidence.		

Submission stages

1. **Stage 1 — Proposal and annotated bibliography.** One-page proposal and at least eight annotated sources (from Lesson 4.4).
2. **Stage 2 — Peer-reviewed draft.** A partner checks organization by reason, accuracy of every quotation and number, and the counterclaim; submit a revision note naming two changes and the feedback behind them.
3. **Stage 3 — Final argument.** 1,800-2,500 words, MLA, Works Cited, research log.
4. **Stage 4 — Five-minute research defense with questions.** Live or recorded; equal-credit options.

Revision log

> One line per change: *what I changed, and why.* "Fixed grammar" is not a change; "cut the first paragraph because the essay actually started in the second" is.

Draft	What I changed	Why — and what made me see it